

**Materials Review Committee
Reconsideration of Materials Summary – 2014**

Date	Item Description	Summary of Customer Comments	Findings and Action Taken
Feb. 2014	<p>Compliance</p> <p>Directed by Craig Zobel, Magnolia Pictures, 2013</p> <p>Adult DVD (14A)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Depicts men and women as stupid and willing to facilitate sexual abuse • Disturbing and implausible • Remove from the collection. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The movie depicts the abuse of a female fast-food worker by her manager and others on the instructions of a telephone caller posing as a policeman. • It was based on a series of true events described in a 2005 ABC News report. The director stated that the intention was to draw attention to the dangers of unquestioningly obeying authority and how easily people can be manipulated. • Reviews were almost all positive and critics agreed that the film was difficult to watch but that the message was important and timely. • It was nominated for several independent film awards including one from the Toronto Film Critics Association. • Retained in the adult collection
Aug. 2014	<p>Zheng Jiu Wang Yin Shao Nian [Save Internet-Addicted Children: 48 Ways to Guide Children in Proper Internet Use]</p> <p>Written by Huafang Cui, Chinese Water & Power Press, 2007</p> <p>Adult Chinese Book</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Incites hatred against Falun Gong (complaint came from Falun Dafa Association of Toronto) • Remove from the collection and take more care that similar books are not purchased. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To ensure that the translation of the chapter appended to the complaint was accurate, the Library asked a City translator to translate it. • The book's stated aim is to provide parents with strategies to guide their children in safe use of the internet through various scenarios, one of which describes a boy telling his father he is going to commit suicide based on the teachings of a Falun Gong website he is visiting in secret. Falun Gong is referred to as an illicit organization. • According to both Amnesty International and the U.S. State Department, the Chinese government has a history of abuse of Falun Gong members and the negative depiction in the book reflects this view. The publisher of the book is state owned.

Date	Item Description	Summary of Customer Comments	Findings and Action Taken
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The inclusion of an anti-Falun Gong message in a book described as a parental guide to internet use is inaccurate and misleading. • Selectors of multilingual materials do their utmost to ensure that the content follows the Library’s guidelines and pay close attention to books on sensitive topics. They have been reminded to be vigilant. • Moved from the general collection to the Toronto Reference Library for research purposes
Aug. 2014	<p>Camp Harlow</p> <p>Written and directed by Shane Hawks, Pure Flix Entertainment 2014</p> <p>Children’s DVD</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Deceptive as packaging does not reflect religious content • By suggesting that joining the Baptist Church is the best way to overcome struggles, violates proposition one of the <i>Ontario Library Association Statement on the Rights of the Individual</i> which informs Toronto Public Library’s <i>Materials Selection Policy</i> • Remove from children’s collection and label “religious content/advertisement”. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A troubled teenager finds herself at a Baptist summer camp where, although initially resisting, she ultimately converts and is baptized. • It was released directly to DVD. There are no reviews but it is owned by 155 libraries worldwide and circulated over 300 times from May to August 2014. • It was agreed that the packaging does not reflect the religious content so the description in the catalogue was amended as the Library does not label material as to content. • In addition, the DVD was moved to the adult collection as the subject of a teenager’s religious conversion is a complex one not suited to the children’s collection. • There are many items in the collection that describe and promote particular religious and spiritual beliefs. The <i>Materials Selection Policy</i> notes that, “The Library recognizes the right of any individual or group to reject library materials for personal use, but does not accord to any individual or group the right to restrict the freedom of others to make use of that same material.” This supports the <i>Ontario Library Association Statement on the Rights of the Individual</i>, which states that it is “...the right of the citizen... to judge individually on questions of politics, religion and mortality”.

Date	Item Description	Summary of Customer Comments	Findings and Action Taken
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Moved to the adult DVD collection
Oct. 2014	<p>Cheng Shi Zhen Quing Hui Ben</p> <p>[No author], Yow Fu Culture Company Ltd. [n.d.]</p> <p>Children's Picture Book</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Grammatical errors that make it difficult for children to follow stories and improve skills • Contact publisher with concerns and ensure books are selected by Chinese speakers knowledgeable about the written language. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Because of the complex nature of the complaint, the Library asked a PhD candidate in Mandarin to assess the book. Library staff reviewed the detailed response, which was appended to the Library's reply and sent to the customer. • <i>Cheng Shi Zhen Quing Hui Ben</i> does contain errors that would make it difficult for reader comprehension. • Withdrawn from the collection • Selectors are fluent in Mandarin and/or Cantonese and can read the appropriate script. They will review the small number of titles that the Library owns from the publisher of <i>Cheng Shi Zhen Quing Hui Ben</i>.
Oct 2014	<p>Shui Na Zou Wo De Liu Liu Qiu</p> <p>Written by Menhua Li, [n.d.]</p> <p>Children's Kit</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Grammatical errors that make it difficult for children to follow stories and improve skills • Contact publisher with concerns and ensure books are selected by Chinese speakers knowledgeable about the written language 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Because of the complex nature of the complaint, the Library asked a PhD candidate in Mandarin to assess the kit. Library staff reviewed the detailed response, which was appended to the Library's reply and sent to the customer. • The choice of informal language is appropriate for <i>Shui Na Zou Wo De Liu Liu Qiu</i> as it is meant to be read aloud. • Retained in the children's Chinese collection • Selectors are fluent in Mandarin and/or Cantonese and can read the appropriate script.